**Fourteenth Loksabha**

**Session : 7**
**Date : 22-02-2006**
**Participants : Mistry Shri Madhusudan Devram,Singh Shri Prabhunath,Geete Shri Anant Gangaram,Advani Shri Lal Krishna,Malhotra Prof. Vijay Kumar,Tripathy Shri Braja Kishore**

>

Title : Regarding the Defreezing of Accounts of Quattrocchi and other persons allegedly invovled in Bofors Gun Deals.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I come to the important matters. May I make one respectful submission? As many as possible matters of importance will be allowed to be raised provided we speak to the point and there is no disturbance from each other. My earnest appeal is this. You have all got important issues to raise. Let them be presented in this House to which people are looking in a manner which helps our dignity. Therefore, let us not be impatient of each other. Let us listen to each other. At the appropriate time, we shall respond.

Now, I request the Leader of the Opposition to speak. Mr. Advani, I have a request. In future, your office may kindly send a notice to the Notice Office.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI (GANDHINAGAR): I have sent it.

MR. SPEAKER: I had entertained your letter but I am only requesting that your office may send it to the Notice Office. Otherwise, records are not maintained.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Thank you.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am extremely grateful to you for allowing me to raise this particular matter. I am gratified that the Prime Minister was also here because this is a matter on which the whole country would like to know the full facts as to what happened and how it happened. It is because what we have read in the newspaper or what we have heard from the media does not satisfy anyone[m7].

It does not satisfy anyone that the process that ought to be adopted in an important matter of this kind has not been properly adopted.

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Advaniji, I am told there is a proceeding. Therefore, please steer clear of that.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Yes, sir. I will steer clear of everything.

I will only like to know from the hon. Prime Minister as to who decided that these accounts in the name of Quttrocchi in two London banks should be defrozen. Who decided? I have seen that the moment this news appeared, there were protests from almost all sections of the media. There were protests from all sections of the political circles. Of course, the NDA protested. I heard that even the Left Parties protested. I saw a statement.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Why 'even'?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : 'Even' because you are supporting this Government; you are in alliance …… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Not in alliance.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : If any Party that was in alliance with NDA also protested about something, then it acquires a very important significance. That is all. I welcome the fact that you protested. Every section protested; so much so that I saw that the General Secretary of the CPI(M) Shri Prakash Karat told the Press that the Party strongly objected to a person being sent to London authorising the de-freezing of these accounts. Not only that, but after that Shri Sitaram Yechury had a one-hour meeting with Shrimati Sonia Gandhi, the Congress President to find out why it had happened. What was the answer given? Shrimati Sonia Gandhi, the Chairperson of the UPA told the Left Front that the Government had no advance knowledge of the CBI decision to allow the de-freezing of Ottavio Quttrocchi's London bank accounts and we had no information. This is what Sonia Gandhiji told the Left Front. … (*Interruptions*) This meeting lasted one hour.

Not only that. The hon. Prime Minister is here. I have seen the hon. Prime Minister's own statement. The hon. Prime Minister's statement says : "The act of frreezing or de-freezing was not done at the behest of the Government. It fell strictly within the domain of the functional responsibility of the CBI which took the necessary steps going by the right legal advice". So, it is attributed to the CBI that it has done whatever it has done.

I also find it strange that the CBI, just a couple of days before Shri Dutta left for London – Shri Dutta is the law officer who went to have the accounts defrozen – just two days before that, according to the court records, the CBI, on 20th December, 2005 said in the court of the Chief Metropolitan Magistrate, Seema Maini : "To apprehend the accused" he is still an accused, "a red corner notice was still in existence and details of the present whereabouts of the accused would be submitted soon to the court". Just a couple of days before these accounts

are defrozen, the court is told that he is still a fugitive from the law and a red corner notice is still in existence against him.

Who is being misled? Is the court being misled or is Sonia Gandhiji misleading the Left Front or is the hon. Prime Minister misleading the country? … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : That part is not on the Government's responsibility, if some Member is misleading another Member.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, we do not know. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. This is very wrong. I made a request to all of you.

… (*Interruptions*[krr8])

MR. SPEAKER: There are competent hon. Ministers over here.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : The Law Minister is also here. The Law Minister virtually says that there is no evidence against Ottavio Quattrocchi. The Government on Thursday, the January 12 said that the CBI had found no evidence against the Italian businessman Ottavio Quattrocchi in the Bofors pay-off case and this was conveyed to the British Government. The Law Minister, Shri H.R. Bhardwaj, said that the Crown Prosecution of the British Government had, over the past two years, sought evidence against Quattrocchi and the British Government had frozen Quattrocchi's bank accounts. The British Government had not frozen his bank accounts on its own; it was on the request of the CBI that they had frozen these accounts in UK and offshore islands, on the India's request three years ago. The Crown Prosecution had sought the status of the investigations and we have conveyed to them the recent rulings of the High Court rejecting the case against the Hinduja brothers. Now, this is also another story.

Five different matters were decided in the High Court in favour of the various accused in the Bofors case. In three cases, the Government appealed to the Supreme Court and they were upturned. Only in two cases, the Government did not appeal. Even though the CBI wanted it to be appealed, the Government did not appeal. I would admit that my own Government, the NDA Government did not appeal because the case against Rajiv Gandhi was decided by the High Court in favour, exonerating Rajiv Gandhi, in February. Therefore, we did not appeal. We felt that the elections had been announced, let the new Government, whichever Government comes, decide and we did not decide. Then, their Government came.

I do not want to comment on the High Court's judgement. There are judicial authorities whom I have heard commenting on that judgement, but they were the only two cases. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: That is not to be done.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I have not commented; I have cautiously said that I am not commenting and yet you make observations of a nature as if I have done something wrong. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, I did not say that.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : I simply said that I am not commenting, but everyone did expect the Government to appeal. Even the CBI wanted it because certain observations either in the Hinduja case or in the Rajiv Gandhi case had been made against the CBI. The CBI was also keen that at least those comments should be scored out and therefore, there should be an appeal. But that apart, they were the only two cases, where the Government did not go in appeal, which are being cited in favour of Quattrocchi. … (*Interruptions*)

**कुँवर मानवेन्द्र सिंह (मथुरा) :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब अयोध्या का मामला था, तब इन्होंने …(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is being recorded. Why do you bother? By your intervention, it becomes a bigger problem.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : They are intervening and he has pointed out. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have already said that his statement will not be recorded.

… (*Interruptions*)

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) :** सर, आप हमें डांट रहे हैं। जब उधर से व्यवधान पैदा करने का प्रयास किया जा रहा है, तो डांटिए भी उन्हें, हमें नहीं। …(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मैं सबसे ज्यादा उन्हें ही डांटता हूं। Please do not impute motives.

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा :** महोदय, आप डांटते उधर के लोगों को हैं, लेकिन देखते हमारी तरफ हैं। लोगों को लगता है कि आप हमें डांट रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह सही नहीं है। मैं सबसे ज्यादा मानवेन्द्र सिंह को डांटता हूं। आप यह बात जानते हैं। यह हंसने की बात नहीं है। यह बहुत सीरियस मैटर है।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, here is a case in which the accounts of a person have been defrozen, a person who has publicly said that he does not believe in the Indian law system and therefore, he is not going to appear in any Indian court.

He publicly said that : "I am a friend of Shrimati Sonia Gandhi's family, and whatever has been done … " … (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA (GUWAHATI): What has that got to do with you? … (*Interruptions*)

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा :** यह उनका स्टेटमेंट है।...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. This is very difficult. It is very impossible for me to regulate the proceedings.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please try to understand.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मेहरबानी करके आप लोग भी बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will appeal to Shri Advani to make them sit down.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not helping your leader.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Advani does not need any volunteers to help him speak. आप बोलते रहिये।

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is persistent.

MR. SPEAKER: I have ordered him to sit down. Nothing is being recorded.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** हम क्या करें, हमारे पास उनको पकड़ने के लिए पुलिस नहीं है।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will show all of you the photograph as to how every side of the House is behaving.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Sir, except this side of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Advani, I would kindly request you to conclude now.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : In fact, after Mr. Quattrochi made his statement about his friendship with Shrimati Sonia Gandhi's family, I had expected the Congress President to come out very forcefully and say that : "We would like no fugitive to remain away from the court of law." After all Mr. Quattrochi … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please refer to the Government.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : After all Mr. Quattrochi is no different in so far as avoiding law is concerned; in so far as red-corner notice is concerned; and in so far as being a fugitive is concerned. He is no different from Dawood Ibrahim for Mr. Quattrochi is another Dawood Ibrahim. So, there should be no one in the Government who has any soft corner for this kind of a fugitive. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Next is Shri Prabhunath Singh.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : It is, therefore, amazing that the Government goes out of its way to have his accounts de-frozen. Further, I have seen … (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY Sir, it is not the Government, but it is the CBI that … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइये, प्लीज़।

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Do not record anything. Anybody speaking without my permission will not have his statement recorded. आप बोलिये।

*(Interruptions) ...* *

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइये।

…(व्यवधान)

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY : Sir, I want to draw your attention to the fact that … (*Interruptions*) How can he hold the Government responsible? … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not bound by his statement. Nobody is bound by anybody else's statements. He is giving his views on the issue.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Sir, whatever I have said I have said on the basis of records. I have knowledge of certain matters relating to the CBI, but I will not say it because it is not on record. All that I have said is only on the basis of the records. Therefore, even in respect of Shrimati Sonia Gandhi I would respectfully say that if he had not said … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: She does not represent the Government. She does not come within it.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will adjourn the House.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will adjourn the House. What more can I do?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will request Shri Advani to please conclude now.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: All of you please sit down.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठ जाइये।

…(व्यवधान)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK : Sir, she is a Member of this House. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, you cannot just make allegations against a Member.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK : Sir, I have not made any allegation against any Member. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Very well, I have not ruled it out so far.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: आप बैठिये। But I would request that this is …

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह क्या हो रहा है? आप बैठिये न।

…(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मल्होत्रा जी, बैठ जाइये।

...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप कौन हैं? Who are you to regulate this House? Is it your duty to do it?

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बैठिये न, मल्होत्रा जी। Please come here, and I will make you the Speaker!

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा** आप उनको कहिये न।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** हम नहीं कहते क्या? Do not be unfair. Again you are unfair.

… (*Interruptions*)

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा** : वे तो हमेशा ही खड़े रहते हैं।...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: My only intervention was that it is for the Government to answer. Therefore, when you are asking somebody, a Member, to answer that question, only on that point, I made that intervention.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: I started my comments and submissions … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Be ready to be named, Mr. Manvendra Singh. This has become your very bad habit. There is an end to patience.

I would request you now to conclude please. You have taken nearly 25 minutes.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Is it not true, Sir, that no officer of the Government, certainly not such a senior law officer like Mr. Dutta, can go to London without the permission of the Prime Minister? … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Incorrigible, some of you are.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Therefore, when the Prime Minister says that he has nothing to do with it, that he did not know, and that it is the decision by the CBI, and when the CBI tells the Court that Quattrocchi is still a fugitive, there is a Red Corner Notice against him, who is saying untruth? Who is misleading whom?

MR. SPEAKER: Very well, just mention it. This is not a discussion on that. I have allowed you to speak for 20 minutes.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Sometimes, these days, I believe that in the matter of probity, corruption, scandals, scams, accountability is the most important part. Who is accountable? We have a Volcker Report.

MR. SPEAKER: We have seen that. It is becoming a general discussion. I have allowed you to speak for 20 minutes. Even omitting the interruptions, at least, you have had 20 minutes to speak.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: At the time of Special Mentions because of his position, I have given that chance to him.

I will request you to please conclude now.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: I am grateful to you. Mr. Prime Minister, could you reply to my question that if it was the decision of the CBI, why did they submit these affidavits to the Court? Why did the Investigating Officer of the CBI was allowed…

MR. SPEAKER: This is not a discussion. You can only refer to certain issues.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Was he allowed to accompany the Additional Attorney General, Mr. Dutta, to London to discuss the matter with the British Crown Prosecution Service? Was it the CBI's opinion that Quattrocchi's accounts should be de-frozen? My own information is that the CBI was never in favour of the accounts being de-frozen. So, when the Government says that it is not their decision … (*Interruptions*) These are pertinent questions. I would also like to know…

MR. SPEAKER: Please conclude.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Now that the Speaker has allowed us to raise this issue, let the Prime Minister inform the House as to why an appeal was not made to the Supreme Court in respect of these two cases -- Rajiv Gandhi's case and Hindujas' case.

MR. SPEAKER: You have already asked that question.

Shri Prabhunath Singh, I think, you can associate yourself. He has taken 20 minutes.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : On this issue, please allow me to speak.

MR. SPEAKER: No, I will not allow you. Please take your seat, Shri Basu Deb Acharia. For Heaven's sake, please take your seat.

SHRI KINJARAPU YERRANNAIDU (SRIKAKULAM): Sir, please allow all political party leaders to speak for one minute each.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : This is a very important issue and we have our own views on this.

MR. SPEAKER: Only Shri Prabhunath Singh's submission will be taken. I will request him to be very brief. This is a 'Special Mentions' time.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार)** : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं पांच मिनट ही लूंगा।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** : यह हम देखेंगे कि आप कितना समय लेंगे। Do not misuse it. I will discontinue this system. Indulgence should not be misused.

...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** : आपको क्या हो रहा है? I will strictly follow what we have decided, that is, to take up five matters for half-an-hour.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** अध्यक्ष महोदय, श्री लाल कृण आडवाणी जी ने सभी तथ्यों को आपके और सदन के समक्ष रखा है। यह मामला दलाली से जुड़ा हुआ है। यह हम नहीं उठा रहे हैं, तत्कालीन कांग्रेस के वित्त मंत्री श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह ने यह सवाल उठाया था। यह सवाल उस दिन उठा था...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** : इन सदस्य का नाम क्या हैं? Shri J.M. Aaron Rashid, please stand up. I would pass an order on you.

... (*Interruptions*)

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : अध्यक्ष महोदय, हम किसी का नाम नहीं ले रहे हैं।...(व्यक्ÉvÉÉxÉ[c9])

MR. SPEAKER: Maybe you will also be there soon!

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह मामला श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह ने उठाया था।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** हम सब नेतागणों से विनती करते हैं कि please cooperate. This is not the way. The issue is important according to the hon. Leader of Opposition and I have allowed him twenty minutes.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : हम मेरिट पर नहीं जाना चाहते। मेरिट पर जाएंगे तो सन् 1964 से आना पड़ेगा कि कैसे-कैसे ...*

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** इस बारे में बात नहीं करें।

...(व्यवधान)

---

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : हम मेरिट पर नहीं बोलना चाहते।...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not allowing anything to be said for which there is no basis. No references are here. This is one specific matter. I would not allow anything else.

… (*Interruptions*)

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : हमने कुछ नहीं कहा है।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आपने नाम लिया है।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: This is too much.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Very well! If You do not want a proper discussion, I will adjourn the House.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will adjourn the House and give the Government an opportunity to get time.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It seems, the House is not in a mood to listen. I will adjourn the House.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह** : हमने कहा क्या है?...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मेहरबानी करके आप बैठ जाइए। हमने आपसे सलाह नहीं मांगी है।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** हम इसकी मेरिट, डीमेरिट पर नहीं जा रहे हैं, हम बहुत कम समय में अपनी बात समाप्त करना चाहते हैं। हम कहना चाहते हैं कि श्री क्वात्रोची के दो खाते खोले गए। प्रधान मंत्री जी का बयान आया था कि यह उनकी जानकारी में नहीं है, सीबीआई अपनी तरफ से कर रही है। हम प्रधान मंत्री जी से सिर्फ यह जानना चाहेंगे कि सरकार से ऊपर सीबीआई है या सरकार के अंदर सीबीआई है? ठीक है, सीबीआई एक इंडीपैंडैंट संस्था है, वह अपनी भूमिका अदा करती है, लेकिन अगर दुनिया के दूसरे देशों से सीबीआई कोई कार्य करती है, आती है, जाती है, उसके लोग आते हैं, जाते हैं, तो सरकार को उसकी सूचना दी जाती है, नहीं दी जाती है, सरकार से बिना सूचना के वे लोग बाहर जाते हैं, प्रधान मंत्री जी का इस तरह कहना, हम मानते हैं कि यह बयान देश को गुमराह करने वाला है, यह भारी घपले, घोटाले का मामला है और वह जहां का रहने वाला है, उस देश का नाम इटली है। ...* हम आपसे निवेदन करना चाहते हैं कि यह देश किसी एक व्यक्ति का नहीं है, यह देश सबका है।...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing to be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...* **

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आपकी बात रिकार्ड हो रही है।

...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बोलते रहिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** आप आसन पर बैठे हुए हैं। मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहूंगा कि जिस तरह इस देश में हो रहा है कि एक लॉबी काम कर रही है और देश का खजाना, जो दलाली के रूप में लिया गया, इंग्लैंड में जमा किया गया और यहां गलत तरीके से उस रुपये को निकालने की छूट दी गई ..* है। प्रधान मंत्री जी इस बात से अपने को बचाने के लिए जो बयान दे रहे हैं, वह गलत बयानी हो रही है।...(व्यवधान) वैसी स्थिति में हम चाहेंगे कि सरकार...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will see this record.

...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बोलिए।

...(व्यवधान)

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, इन्हें समझाइए, नहीं तो हम सब खाते खोल देंगे।...(व्यवधान) *

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Prabhunath Singh, please stick to the subject.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** हम सब खाते खोल देंगे तो दिमाग ठीक हो जाएगा।...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** प्लीज़, आप बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You are a very experienced Member. You are a leader now of your Party. इस ईशू को उठाया गया। This is Special Mentions time. On this issue the

---

* Expuned as ordered by the Chair.

** Not Recorded.

hon. Leader of the Opposition has taken twenty minutes omitting the interruptions. Now you have to refer strictly to that if you have to associate with him.

Now, you are bringing so many other issues.

... (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** यह किसने बोला? आप इधर आइये और यहां बैठिये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Member, I thought you were a sensible person. You are a new Member already got into the bad habit.

Shri Prabhunath Singh, please restrict yourself to this. I had already spoken to the Government. I believe, Government is ready to respond. But you refer to the issue. You are converting this into a discussion under Rule 193 or under Rule 184. Then, this is the misuse of the opportunity that is being given, if I may say so, very humbly. With such astuteness, Shri Prabhunath Singh, please be brief and complete your speech.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, हम आपकी बात मानते हुए कहना चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव (पटना) :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, इन्होंने अपनी बात कह दी है, तो फिर आप इन्हें क्यों खड़ा कर रहे हैं ? ...(व्यवधान)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप बोलते रहिये।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I will look into it and anything found unparliamentary, the same will be deleted.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please be brief. Speak on the point, nothing more.

**श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब हम खड़े होते हैं, तो इन लोगों को कांच की तरह चुभते हैं। हम कोई अलग से नहीं बोलना चाहते। हम आपके आदेश को मानते हुए कहना चाहते हैं कि आडवाणी जी ने जिन सवालों को उठाया है, उनके संबंध में हम प्रधान मंत्री जी से चाहेंगे कि वे एक-एक बिन्दु को स्पट करें ताकि देश को गुमराह करने का जो वाता वरण बना हुआ है, सरकार के प्रति लोगों के मन में जो गुस्सा या आक्रोश बना हुआ है, उससे देश के लोग जान सकें कि कांग्रेस की हुकूमत किस तरह से एक दलाल को संरक्षण दे रही है। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Braja Kishore Tripathy, only one minute. All the issues have been covered. You can associate with them.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY I will try. I will definitely refer to those points which have not been brought out here.

MR. SPEAKER This is not a discussion. I will not allow a long discussion. Enough is enough.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY Sir, the Bofors gun deal had shocked the conscience of the nation and became symbolic of corruption in public life. Now, it seems that the CBI has been completely subverted its independence. Having filed a charge-sheet against Quattrocchi with substantive evidence... … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: All that has been said.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY CBI initiated extradition proceedings, having issued a Red Corner alert.... … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: That has already been stated. I will not allow this, Shri Tripathy.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : Having got his accounts frozen, it is now contending that it has no evidence against Quattrocchi.

MR. SPEAKER: You are repeating the same matter.

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : When the CBI has filed its petition and there is evidence against Quattrocchi, now CBI is saying that there is no evidence. The CBI is completely subverting its independence. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Would the Government like to respond?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Member, you have not given any notice. No one will be allowed to speak, without the notice.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BRAJA KISHORE TRIPATHY : When there is a Congress Government at the Centre, it is trying to cover up the issue of Bofors. … (*Interruptions*) I would like to give two or three examples. In one minute, I would complete. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No. Nothing more will be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...* *

MR. SPEAKER: I am sorry, nothing will be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...* *

MR. SPEAKER: Does the Government want to respond?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I do not compel the Government to respond? Would the Government like to respond?

… (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Yes, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: Then, do it.

… (*Interruptions*)

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** क्या बात है।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: How can you say that?

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : The Prime Minister has to reply, not the Minister of State. … (*Interruptions*)

**श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते (रत्नागिरि) :** यह मजाक किया जा रहा है। ...(व्यवधान) इतने गंभीर इश्यू को इस तरह से लिया जा रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, Shri Pachouri.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

* Not Recorded.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : No, we will not listen to him. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You cannot dictate to me like that. I do not find anything wrong. It is for the Government to decide as to who has to reply.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Since you do not want to hear the Government, let Shri Gurudas Dasgupta speak.

… (*Interruptions*)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA The Prime Minister has misled the nation. The Prime Minister should resign… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANANT GANGARAM GEETE The Prime Minister has misled the nation. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot compel the Prime Minister to speak. Nobody can compel the Government. It seems you do not want to listen to the Government. Let Shri Gurudas Dasgupta speak.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Gurudas Dasgupta's issue will be taken up.

**12.36 hrs.**

(*At this stage, Shri Manjunath Kunnur and some other hon. Members came*

*and stood on the floor near the Table.*)

MR. SPEAKER: I want to appeal to the hon. Leader of the Opposition that he had his full say. Now if you agree to hear the Government's view, it can respond. It is for the Government to decide which Minister will speak.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: It seems that you are not prepared to listen. It is a very unfortunate situation. I cannot allow this. Please go back to your seats.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is a deliberate obstruction to the proceedings. I am very sorry to say that you are deliberately obstructing the proceedings of the House.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: To say the least, it is most unfortunate that you only want to have your opportunity. And after getting full opportunity to speak, you do not want to hear the Government side. This is very unfortunate.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: With a great sense of sorrow and after recording my total condemnation of the method that is adopted, I am compelled to say that the main Opposition and its supporters, having their say in the matter, are not allowing the Government to respond to that. The Government has agreed to respond at my suggestion. Since the Opposition is not allowing the House to continue, I adjourn it till 2 O'clock.

**12.39 hrs.**

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen. of the Clock.*

---

**14.01 hrs.**

(The Lok Sabha re-assembled at one minute past Fourteen of the Clock)

(Mr. Deputy Speaker in the Chair)

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली)** उपाध्यक्ष जी, मैं केवल इतना ही कहना चाहता हूं कि आज राट्रपति जी के अभिभाण पर रखे गए धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव पर चर्चा का जवाब प्रधान मंत्री जी देंगे। हमने प्रातः क्वात्रोच्चि जी के सम्बन्ध में मामला उठाया था। इसलिए हम चाहते हैं कि प्रधान मंत्री जी जब जवाब दें तो इस सम्बन्ध में उठाए गए प्रश्नों का भी उत्तर दें। अगर वह इन प्रश्नों का उत्तर नहीं देंगे, तो हम अपनी राय व्यक्त करेंगे।...(व्यवधान)

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (होशियारपुर)** : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, बहुत ही गम्भीर मामला है।

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** अभी नहीं, छः बजे उठाना।

Now, we will take up Item No. 8—Matters under Rule 377.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKHBIR SINGH BADAL (FARIDKOT): Sir, how can there be two laws in a State?… (*Interruptions*) How can there be two laws in the country -- one for the police and one for the common man?… (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions) ...**

SHRI SUKHBIR SINGH BADAL : Sir, for the last two days we have been raising this issue… (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Hon. Minster of Parliamentary Affairs wants to respond. Let us hear him.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, in response to the issues raised by the distinguished Leader of the Opposition, Advaniji and a few other respected leaders, I would respectfully submit that we wanted to respond instantly, but

however they insisted that the Prime Minister should respond. While the Prime

* Not Recorded.

Minister is already scheduled to reply to the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, our Minister Incharge for this department, will make a statement in this House. As and when he comes, I would seek your indulgence. Thank you.… (*Interruptions*)

**प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : प्रधान मंत्री जी से पहले नहीं।**

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, I think, it has never been the practice that the Government is dictated by the Members as to when a Minister should make a statement.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : He can speak any time. But we are talking about that very issue.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : It has never been the practice. I think, he knows better than me about the rules. The Government cannot be dictated by any Member as to when the Minister should make a statement.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, the Minister can intervene in the debate; we have no objection. But on that very specific issue, we want the Prime Minister to reply.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Yes, Mr. Avinash Khanna.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, it is the time of the debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. Zero Hour is already disposed of. If Members raise any matter, how would I dispose of the business? I seek your protection.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Minister, I know, and I want to run the House. Let me conduct the proceedings.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The hon. Leader of the Opposition has requested that he may be given a minute to speak.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : He may make his submission. But Sir, if everybody starts raising his issue, it would be difficult to dispose of the listed business.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am allowing him only and not anybody else. Now, let us hear the submission of Shri Avinash Khanna.

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना :** पंजाब के गवर्नमेंट ऑफिशियल का स्टेटमेंट आया है कि पंजाब में 300 से ज्यादा आतंकवादी ऐसे हैं, जो जिन्दा हैं, लेकिन रिकार्ड में उन्हें मरा हुआ शो किया हुआ है। महोदय, अब यह प्वाइंट रेज होता है कि जो 300 सौ लोग मरे, वे कौन थे? किनको मारकर पुलिस ने कम्पेंसेशन लिया, एवार्ड लिया या प्रमोशन लिया? आज पालिटिकल लोगों को इसमें यूज करने की प्लानिंग हो रही है। इसके संबंध में हम केंद्र सरकार से स्टेटमेंट चाहते हैं।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, we will take up item no. 8, Matters Under Rule 377.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKHBIR SINGH BADAL : Sir, it is in the national interest that I am raising this matter. The Police Chief of a State is harbouring militants. … (*Interruptions*)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आपका प्वाइंट आ गया है।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No. It is not to be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...* *

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It should not be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is not to be recorded.

*(Interruptions) ...* *

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please do not disturb the House.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

* Not Recorded.

SHRI SUKHBIR SINGH BADAL : Sir, we are walking out in protest.

**14.06 hrs.**

*(At this stage, Shri Sukhbir Singh Badal and some other*

*hon. Members left the House.)*

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Sir, there was an understanding that Matters Under Rule 377 would be laid.

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** वे कह रहे हैं कि हम ले नहीं करेंगे।

…(व्यवधान)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, there was an understanding that till the time we dispose of the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, we will lay the Matters Under Rule 377 on the Table of the House. If we take it up now, how could I accommodate the other business? … (*Interruptions*)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** अभी उनसे पूछ लेते हैं।

…(व्यवधान)

**श्री थावरचंद गेहलोत (शाजापुर) :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, बड़ी मुश्किल से तो नंबर आता है …(व्यवधान)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: I respect the feelings. I was also doing the same thing. But on the first day, we discussed and decided about that. The time is very short now and the hon. Leader of the Opposition is to speak on the Motion. At 5.30 p.m., the Prime Minister has to reply here and go to the other House. We have a list of speakers. On the first day, the Matters Under Rule 377 were laid on the Table of the House. It was decided to lay them only till the time we dispose of the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address and not later on. … (*Interruptions*) Shri Yerrannaidu, I am not opposing that. But this is the decision that was taken. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Okay, let us take it up now. All the hon. Members listed here can take only one or two minutes and finish this.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Sir, once we dispose of the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, they can read it out; there is no problem in that.

… (*Interruptions*)

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** हाउस के सम्माननीय सदस्य अगर ऐसा चाहते हैं, should it be taken up or laid on the Table of the House?

**श्री हरिसिंह चावड़ा (बनासकांठा) :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, सिर्फ दो-दो मिनट की बात है।

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Sir, after the disposal of this debate, they can read it out; after 6 o'clock, they can read it out; I do not mind. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Anyway, now let me call one by one.

---